

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL FOR LEGAL RESEARCH AND ANALYSIS



Open Access, Refereed Journal Multi-Disciplinary
Peer Reviewed

www.ijlra.com

DISCLAIMER

No part of this publication may be reproduced or copied in any form by any means without prior written permission of Managing Editor of IJLRA. The views expressed in this publication are purely personal opinions of the authors and do not reflect the views of the Editorial Team of IJLRA.

Though every effort has been made to ensure that the information in Volume II Issue 7 is accurate and appropriately cited/referenced, neither the Editorial Board nor IJLRA shall be held liable or responsible in any manner whatsoever for any consequences for any action taken by anyone on the basis of information in the Journal.

Copyright © International Journal for Legal Research & Analysis

EDITORIAL TEAM

EDITORS

Dr. Samrat Datta

Dr. Samrat Datta Seedling School of Law and Governance, Jaipur National University, Jaipur. Dr. Samrat Datta is currently associated with Seedling School of Law and Governance, Jaipur National University, Jaipur. Dr. Datta has completed his graduation i.e., B.A.LL.B. from Law College Dehradun, Hemvati Nandan Bahuguna Garhwal University, Srinagar, Uttarakhand. He is an alumnus of KIIT University, Bhubaneswar where he pursued his post-graduation (LL.M.) in Criminal Law and subsequently completed his Ph.D. in Police Law and Information Technology from the Pacific Academy of Higher Education and Research University, Udaipur in 2020. His area of interest and research is Criminal and Police Law. Dr. Datta has a teaching experience of 7 years in various law schools across North India and has held administrative positions like Academic Coordinator, Centre Superintendent for Examinations, Deputy Controller of Examinations, Member of the Proctorial Board



Dr. Namita Jain



Head & Associate Professor

School of Law, JECRC University, Jaipur Ph.D. (Commercial Law) LL.M., UGC -NET Post Graduation Diploma in Taxation law and Practice, Bachelor of Commerce.

Teaching Experience: 12 years, AWARDS AND RECOGNITION of Dr. Namita Jain are - ICF Global Excellence Award 2020 in the category of educationalist by I Can Foundation, India. India Women Empowerment Award in the category of "Emerging Excellence in Academics by Prime Time & Utkrisht Bharat Foundation, New Delhi.(2020). Conferred in FL Book of Top 21 Record Holders in the category of education by Fashion Lifestyle Magazine, New Delhi. (2020). Certificate of Appreciation for organizing and managing the Professional Development Training Program on IPR in Collaboration with Trade Innovations Services, Jaipur on March 14th, 2019

Mrs.S.Kalpana

Assistant professor of Law

Mrs.S.Kalpana, presently Assistant professor of Law, VelTech Rangarajan Dr. Sagunthala R & D Institute of Science and Technology, Avadi. Formerly Assistant professor of Law, Vels University in the year 2019 to 2020, Worked as Guest Faculty, Chennai Dr.Ambedkar Law College, Pudupakkam. Published one book. Published 8Articles in various reputed Law Journals. Conducted 1Moot court competition and participated in nearly 80 National and International seminars and webinars conducted on various subjects of Law. Did ML in Criminal Law and Criminal Justice Administration. 10 paper presentations in various National and International seminars. Attended more than 10 FDP programs. Ph.D. in Law pursuing.



Avinash Kumar



Avinash Kumar has completed his Ph.D. in International Investment Law from the Dept. of Law & Governance, Central University of South Bihar. His research work is on "International Investment Agreement and State's right to regulate Foreign Investment." He qualified UGC-NET and has been selected for the prestigious ICSSR Doctoral Fellowship. He is an alumnus of the Faculty of Law, University of Delhi. Formerly he has been elected as Students Union President of Law Centre-1, University of Delhi. Moreover, he completed his LL.M. from the University of Delhi (2014-16), dissertation on "Cross-border Merger & Acquisition"; LL.B. from the University of Delhi (2011-14), and B.A. (Hons.) from Maharaja Agrasen College, University of Delhi. He has also obtained P.G. Diploma in IPR from the Indian Society of International Law, New Delhi. He has qualified UGC – NET examination and has been awarded ICSSR – Doctoral Fellowship. He has published six-plus articles and presented 9 plus papers in national and international seminars/conferences. He participated in several workshops on research methodology and teaching and learning.

ABOUT US

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL FOR LEGAL RESEARCH & ANALYSIS
ISSN

2582-6433 is an Online Journal is Monthly, Peer Review, Academic Journal, Published online, that seeks to provide an interactive platform for the publication of Short Articles, Long Articles, Book Review, Case Comments, Research Papers, Essay in the field of Law & Multidisciplinary issue. Our aim is to upgrade the level of interaction and discourse about contemporary issues of law. We are eager to become a highly cited academic publication, through quality contributions from students, academics, professionals from the industry, the bar and the bench. INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL FOR LEGAL RESEARCH & ANALYSIS ISSN 2582-6433 welcomes contributions from all legal branches, as long as the work is original, unpublished and is in consonance with the submission guidelines.

SENTIENT BEINGS: RECOGNIZING ANIMAL RIGHTS IN LEGAL JURISPRUDENCE OF INDIA

AUTHORED BY - SHREERANGAM BARAI

Abstract

In the realm of animal law, the recognition of animal sentience stands as a pivotal point in the ongoing struggle to protect nonhuman creatures. It serves as a formidable barrier against attempts to deny them legal safeguarding merely based on their perceived appeal, emotional proximity, or economic utility to humans. Through the lens of comparative law and moral philosophy, the complexities surrounding animal sentience are dissected, revealing both its strengths and limitations in the fight for animal rights. Historically, animals were often relegated to the status of lower sentient beings, devoid of legal rights beyond their utility to humans. However, the tide began to turn as scholars advocated for the legal recognition of animals, not merely as property, but as entities deserving of inherent protections. In essence, while the legal recognition of animal sentience represents a monumental achievement in the realm of animal law, it is but one piece of a larger puzzle. To truly effect meaningful change and create a world where animals are free from human interference, a concerted effort is required to address not only legal deficiencies but also societal attitudes and cultural norms that perpetuate harm towards animals. In the ongoing quest for animal rights and protections, it is imperative to continue challenging the status quo, advocating for the rights and dignity of all sentient beings, and striving towards a future where compassion and empathy extend to every corner of the animal kingdom. This paper will thus examine the acknowledgment of animals' legal status in India.

KEYWORDS: Legal Status – Animal Sentience – Indian Jurisprudence – Cruelty – Ecology

1. Introduction

Animal rights are growing more and more significant in today's globe, and India is no different. The complex web of laws and policies relating to animal protection in India's legal system reflects this growing understanding. The Wildlife Protection Act and the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act are only two prominent examples.

This legal framework isn't static. It evolves alongside societal values, ethical considerations, and

scientific advancements. When it comes to interpreting these rules and recognizing animal rights, courts are extremely important. Although the concept of animal welfare has been recognized for many years, there has been a notable push in recent times for the establishment of legally binding rights and their efficient execution.

The possibility of both physical and psychological suffering in many animal species has been clarified by modern science. Research shows that birds and mammals can experience distress and pain. For instance, captive elephants can suffer from chronic foot problems.

Regarding the use of animals for labour, food, and other purposes, Indian society and law were clear in the past. However, after the establishment of the Indian Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals (SPCA), things started to change. A major step in providing animals with legal protection was the 1962 passage of the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act. With its modifications, this Act recognizes the probable necessity of using animals in some circumstances while emphasizing the prevention of needless suffering. This reflects a balancing act often echoed in the judiciary: recognizing animal rights while considering human interests. This very tension is what sparks many of the ongoing debates and legal challenges in the field of animal rights today.

1.1. Importance of Animal Rights

The recognition of animal rights is a critical issue gaining significant public support in India. This is a result of two main factors: mounting scientific data and increased public awareness of the link between violence against animals and human populations.

Fundamentally, animal rights are the views that animals have inherent rights¹, such as the absence of needless suffering. Ideally, this would translate to legal protection enforced by the courts, giving animals a voice in legal proceedings. To achieve this, India needs comprehensive animal protection legislation. Such laws would not only promote humane treatment but also raise public education and awareness. Fulfilling this moral obligation to animals and nature would lead to a more harmonious and prosperous society.

However, recognizing animal rights goes beyond just physical well-being². It acknowledges the potential for cognitive, emotional, and instinctive behaviours in animals. This recognition and protection are complex issues still under exploration by legal professionals and animal experts.

¹ Wikiwand, [wikiwand.com/en/Animal_rights](https://www.wikiwand.com/en/Animal_rights)

² The Humane League, (Dec17, 2020), thehumaneleague.org/article/animal-rights

2. Historical Perspective

Philosophical and legal turning points abound in the long history of the animal rights movement. Jainism in India stressed non-violence towards all living things, and the Pythagoreans³ in Greece promoted reverence for animals as early as the sixth century BCE. Thoughts like those of Immanuel Kant, who felt that humans had no moral duty to care for animals, and René Descartes⁴, who thought that animals lacked consciousness, also influenced the discourse for decades.

The 19th century saw a turning point. Jeremy Bentham's idea of considering an animal's capacity to suffer and the passing of the first anti-cruelty legislation in 1822 marked a shift towards recognizing animal welfare. The founding of the RSPCA, the world's first animal welfare charity, further solidified this movement⁵. Henry Stephens Salt's 1894 book "Animals' Rights" became a landmark for the cause.

The 20th century brought Charles Darwin's theory of evolution, highlighting the connection between humans and animals. Peter Singer's influential book⁶ "Animal Liberation" in 1975 argued for the moral consideration of all sentient beings, further propelling the movement. This century also saw the rise of modern animal rights activism with groups like PETA employing various tactics to raise awareness and pressure change⁷.

The 21st century shows growing public concern for animal welfare, with increased scrutiny of factory farming and animal testing. Scientific advancements in understanding animal cognition and sentience provide new arguments for animal rights⁸. The debate on the extent of animal rights, appropriate activism, and balancing human needs with animal welfare continues to this day.

2.1. Influence of religious and cultural beliefs on animal rights

The idea of animal rights is intricately entwined with religion and culture in India, resulting in a multifaceted and intricate environment. The fundamental tenet of Buddhism, Jainism, and Hinduism—ahimsa paramo dharma, or non-violence—promotes respect for all living things,

³ Steven M. Wise, (Feb 24, 2024), www.britannica.com/topic/animal-rights

⁴ Wikipedia, en.wikipedia.org/wiki/History_of_animal_rights

⁵ Karol, Orzechowski, The Animal Rights Movement: History And Facts About Animal Rights, (April 9, 2020), faunalytics.org/the-animal-rights-movement-history-and-facts-about-animal-rights/

⁶ Peter Albert David Singer, Wikipedia, [en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Animal_Liberation_\(book\)](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Animal_Liberation_(book))

⁷ Wikipedia, en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Animal_rights_movement

⁸ Wikipedia, en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Animal_consciousness

including animals, and is a major factor in the rising popularity of vegetarianism⁹. Nonetheless, this reverence culminates in cows, which are revered in various faiths and for which many Indian states have outlawed the killing of cows.

These belief systems are not without their contradictions. While vegetarianism is common, not all Hindus follow it, and religious scriptures allow for animal sacrifice in specific ceremonies, creating a conflict between religious practice and animal welfare concerns. Similarly, traditional festivals may involve animal use, prompting ethical questions and calls for humane treatment from animal rights activists¹⁰.

According to others, vegetarianism in India was influenced more by social class than by compassion for animals. Even meat eaters these days are considering the origins of their meat and the treatment of the animals. Conflicts between animal rights and religion and customs can become complex. Finding a way to reconcile these worries is a constant struggle¹¹. However, religious and cultural views continue to be influential in moulding Indian perspectives on animal rights, and this trend is expected to continue as India develops.

3. Current Legal Framework

In India, the legal framework for animal rights is a complex tapestry woven from central and state laws, mirroring the country's federal structure. The Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act (PCA Act) of 1960 serves as the cornerstone, aiming to prevent unnecessary suffering inflicted upon animals¹². Additional central laws address specific areas like animal transport and the treatment of performing animals.

Enforcement is entrusted to the Animal Welfare Board of India (AWBI), a body established under the PCA Act. The AWBI's responsibilities include issuing guidelines, overseeing enforcement efforts, and advising the government on animal welfare matters. Despite this evolution, challenges persist. Effective implementation remains a hurdle due to limitations in resources and public awareness. Additionally, questions linger regarding the adequacy of the PCA Act in addressing

⁹ Wikipedia, en.wikipedia.org/wiki/History_of_animal_rights

¹⁰ Krishna, N., The History Of Animal Rights In India, (Sept. 9, 2022), faunalytics.org/the-history-of-animal-rights-in-india/

¹¹ Talreja, Chaitanya; Sanchita; Hindu Vegetarianism: Religion and Animal Rights in India, (Sept. 27, 2022), www.areomagazine.com/2022/09/27/hindu-vegetarianism-religion-and-animal-rights-in-india/

¹² Kavuri, Taruni; Overview of Animal Laws in India, (2020), www.animallaw.info/article/overview-animal-laws-india

modern issues like factory farming and animal testing¹³. As India moves forward, discussions on strengthening enforcement, and potentially revising the legal framework, will likely remain at the forefront of ensuring animal welfare.

3.1. Constitutional provisions related to animal rights¹⁴

The Indian Constitution doesn't have a specific clause on animal rights, but it does contain two key provisions that indirectly promote animal welfare. Article 51A(g) outlines the fundamental duties of Indian citizens, including the duty "to protect and improve the environment and to have compassion for all living creatures¹⁵." This emphasizes a moral obligation for citizens to treat animals with compassion and respect, laying the groundwork for advocacy for their welfare.

Another key provision is Article 48A¹⁶, which details principles the government should strive to achieve. One clause states that "the State shall endeavour to protect and improve the environment and to safeguard the forests and wild life of the country." This can be interpreted as a directive for the government to enact laws and policies that safeguard animal life.

3.2. Existing animal welfare laws and regulations

India's legal framework for animal welfare is an intricate tapestry woven from both central and state-specific laws. The Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act (PCA Act) of 1960 serves as the foundation, aiming to prevent unnecessary suffering inflicted upon animals. Furthermore, additional central laws address specific areas of concern. For instance, the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals (Rules for Transport of Animals) ensures humane transportation, while the Performing Animals (Regulation) Rules establish guidelines for the treatment of animals used in performances. The Livestock Slaughter Prevention Act of 2017 is a contentious example, prohibiting cow slaughter in most parts of the country, highlighting the interplay between animal welfare concerns and state-specific regulations¹⁷.

Individual states can enact their own animal welfare laws, leading to a patchwork of regulations

¹³ Wikipedia, en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Animal_welfare_and_rights_in_India

¹⁴ Sana; (May 3, 2018), www.slideshare.net/sana1718/environmental-movements-in-india-and-kerala

¹⁵ Advokate Khoj, www.advokatekhoj.com /library/lawreports/proposaltoconstitute/6.php?Title=Proposal%20to%20Constitute%20Environment%20Courts&STitle=Constitutional%20provisions

¹⁶ Taruni Kavuri; The Constitutional Scheme of Animal Rights in India, (2020), www.animallaw.info/article/constitutional-scheme-animal-rights-india

¹⁷ Showkat Hussain Dar; AN APPRAISAL OF THE CONSTITUTIONAL PROVISIONS FOR THE CONSERVATION OF BIODIVERSITY IN INDIA, (Mar 15, 2015), <http://www.conferenceworld.in/nbloom/fckuploads/P5884-5890.pdf>

across the country. The Animal Welfare Board of India (AWBI), established under the PCA Act, plays a crucial role in issuing guidelines, overseeing enforcement by state authorities and advising the government on animal welfare issues¹⁸. However, effective implementation remains a hurdle due to limitations in resources and public awareness

3.3. Case studies on animal rights litigation in India

While India lacks a central repository for all animal rights litigation cases, some noteworthy examples highlight the growing role of courts in shaping this evolving legal landscape.

One landmark case is *Animal Welfare Board of India v. A. Nagaraja & Ors.* (2014)¹⁹. This Supreme Court case centred around the controversial Jallikattu, a bull-taming practice in Tamil Nadu. Although the court ultimately allowed Jallikattu with restrictions, its verdict held immense significance. The court declared Article 51A(g) of the Indian Constitution, which mandates the protection of animals, as the "magna carta of animal rights" in India. This decision significantly elevated the legal importance of animal welfare.

The issue of cruelty to performing animals came under scrutiny in *PFA vs. State of Kerala* (2021). People for Animals (PFA), an animal rights NGO, challenged the inadequacy of the Performing Animals (Regulation) Rules, arguing they failed to provide sufficient protection. The Kerala High Court acknowledged the limitations of the existing rules and directed the Animal Welfare Board of India (AWBI) to strengthen regulations for ensuring animal welfare in performances. This case exemplifies the judiciary's role in pushing for stricter animal welfare measures.

The Kerala High Court Judgment (2000) demonstrates the expanding scope of who deserves legal protection under animal welfare considerations. The court's judgment addressed the treatment of elephants used in circuses. Recognizing these animals as "beings entitled to dignified existence," the court mandated improved living conditions and proper veterinary care²⁰. This case highlights a broader understanding of animal welfare that extends beyond traditionally considered companion animals.

These cases show how courts are important for interpreting animal welfare laws, enforcing them

¹⁸ Wikipedia, en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Animal_welfare_and_rights_in_India

¹⁹ Animal Welfare Board of India vs A. Nagaraja & Ors, (May 7, 2014), <https://indiankanoon.org/doc/39696860/>

²⁰Harish Pullanoor; Indians can be both unbearably cruel and incredibly kind towards stray dogs (Apr. 8, 2016) <https://qz.com/india/657087/indians-can-be-both-unbearably-cruel-and-incredibly-kind-towards-stray-dogs>

more strictly, and deciding which animals deserve legal protection. As animal rights law evolves in India, courts will likely continue to play a major role in shaping the future of animal rights in the country²¹. However, finding information on these cases can be challenging due to the decentralized court system.

4. Challenges and Controversies

The fight for animal rights in India is a multifaceted battle with victories and hurdles. A major hurdle is ensuring proper enforcement of existing laws. Limited resources for animal welfare agencies and a lack of public awareness about animal rights and legal protections make it difficult to identify and report cruelty, hindering effective enforcement.

Legislative gaps and debates create further complexities. The ability of the PCA Act, the cornerstone of animal welfare legislation, to address modern issues like factory farming is a point of contention. Animal testing presents its own set of challenges. While India seeks alternatives, the lack of readily available and validated non-animal options necessitates some animal testing for medical research²². This necessitates navigating the ethical concerns raised by animal rights activists who advocate for a complete ban.

Stray animal management is another significant challenge²³. The large number of stray animals in India poses problems for public safety, sanitation, and animal welfare itself. Developing effective management strategies is crucial.

Finally, there's an urban-rural divide when it comes to animal welfare concerns. These challenges highlight the ongoing conversations in India about animal rights²⁴. Balancing traditions, economic realities, and evolving ethical considerations is an intricate task that continues to shape the fight for animal rights in India.

4.1. Balancing animal rights with human interests

In India, there's a delicate debate about animal rights. On one side, people argue that we have a

²¹ David Coman-Hidy, THE ETHICAL CASE FOR WELFARE REFORM, (May 16, 2019), <https://thehumaneleague.org/article/why-welfare>

²² Soumya Swaminathan, Vijay Kumar, Rajni Kaul; Need for alternatives to animals in experimentation: An Indian perspective, (May, 2019), www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC6702685/

²³ Parth Maniktala; For the welfare of animals, (Sept. 18, 2020), <https://thehindu.com/opinion/op-ed/for-the-welfare-of-animals/article32633152.ece>

²⁴ Krishna, N., The History Of Animal Rights In India, (Sept. 9, 2022), <https://faunalytics.org/the-history-of-animal-rights-in-india/>

moral duty to prevent animals from unnecessary pain and use. They point to science showing animals can feel and to the environmental harms of factory farming, like pollution and antibiotic resistance.

On the other hand, those prioritizing human interests emphasize the livelihoods and food security of millions who depend on animal agriculture²⁵. Additionally, some cultural and religious practices involve animal use, and scientific research often relies on animal testing. Finding common ground is possible. The "Five Freedoms" framework, which emphasizes providing animals with basic freedoms from hunger, discomfort, pain, and fear, offers a potential path forward. Promoting sustainable farming practices that minimize animal suffering while ensuring food security is another key aspect.²⁶

There's no easy answer when it comes to animal rights in India. Finding the right balance requires open conversations, a search for solutions that consider all sides, and a constant effort to improve animal welfare. As our understanding of animals and our values change, this debate will likely keep going.

4.2. Role of animal rights activists and organizations

Animal rights activists in India are the driving force behind better treatment for animals. They use a variety of tactics to raise awareness, like campaigns, protests, and even street performances. Social media is another weapon in their arsenal, letting them spread information, rally supporters, and expose animal cruelty. They also run educational programs to teach people, especially young people, to be more respectful of animals.

Legal advocacy and enforcement are crucial aspects as well. Organizations file Public Interest Litigations (PILs) to challenge inadequate laws or push for stricter enforcement of existing ones. Many organizations run animal rescue shelters, providing veterinary care and facilitating adoptions, offering a safe haven for animals in need. Animal rights activists don't just fight cruelty, they also promote kinder choices²⁷. Sure, they face challenges like lack of money and some people not liking what they do, but these activists are a major reason more and more Indians care about

²⁵ Annette Manusevich, Factory Farming—Climate Change and Cruelty, (Aug 31, 2022), www.worldanimalprotection.us/latest/blogs/climate-change-and-cruelty/

²⁶ Loknath Saha, ANIMAL CRUELTY LAWS IN INDIA IN RESPECT OF RELIGIOUS SACRIFICES, www.theamikusqraie.com/animal-cruelty-laws-in-india-in-respect-of-religious-sacrifices/

²⁷ Karol, Orzechowski, The Animal Rights Movement: History And Facts About Animal Rights, (April 9, 2020), faunalytics.org/the-animal-rights-movement-history-and-facts-about-animal-rights/

animal welfare²⁸. Their work in education, law, promoting kinder consumption, and even rescuing animals is making a big difference for animals in India.

4.3. Impact of globalization on animal rights in India

Globalization is a mixed bag for animal rights in India. On the upside, it can mean more attention paid to how animals are treated. International trade deals and people wanting higher welfare standards can push India to make stricter animal welfare laws to stay competitive. Also, animal rights groups from other countries can expose problems in India, forcing the government and businesses to improve²⁹. However, there's a downside too. India might loosen its animal welfare laws to attract businesses or compete with countries with weaker laws. This, along with the rise of big fast-food chains, could lead to factory farming in India, which is bad for animals.

So there are a few ways to move forward on animal rights in India. New lab grown meat technologies could mean less reliance on raising animals for food altogether. Also, getting the government, businesses, and animal rights groups to work together is key. If they can find ways to produce food sustainably and ethically, that would be a win for both animals and the economy³⁰. In the end, how much globalization affects animal rights in India depends on the choices people make.

5. International Perspectives

The international community's perspective on animal rights in India is a mix of interest, concern, and a potential for collaboration. Western animal rights organizations play a vital role in raising awareness about potential shortcomings in India's practices, such as factory farming or animal research. They may use campaigns and pressure tactics to push for improved standards from Indian businesses and the government³¹. However, collaboration is also on the table. International organizations can offer expertise and support capacity building for animal welfare enforcement by working alongside their Indian counterparts.

²⁸ DUPLICATE ANIMAL TESTING ENDING IN INDIA, (Step. 11, 2015) <https://crueltyfreeinternational.org/latest-news-and-updates/duplicate-animal-testing-ending-india>

²⁹ Daniel T. Blumstein, Catherine Price, Thom Van Dooren; Is it ethical to change animals' behaviour to protect them?, (June 14, 2023), thehindu.com/sci-tech/energy-and-environment/animals-behaviour-change-conservation-ethics/article66967309.ece

³⁰ Food systems, www.worldanimalprotection.org/our-campaigns/food-systems

³¹ Sustainability in Farm Animal Practice, (Nov, 2021), https://www.bcva.org.uk/system/files/basic_page_files/BCVA%20Sustainability%20Policy%20FINAL%20FOR%20PUBLICATION.pdf

Global consumer pressures are another factor. Consumers in developed countries are increasingly demanding ethically sourced products, putting the onus on global food chains and Indian companies to demonstrate responsible animal welfare practices throughout their supply chains.

International trade agreements can also play a role. While these agreements may include provisions related to animal welfare standards (under sanitary and phytosanitary measures or SPS measures), they can create a potential conflict between trade benefits and animal welfare considerations³².

However, the international community must tread carefully. Cultural and religious sensitivities are important to consider when advocating for animal rights in India. Striking a balance between promoting animal welfare and respecting these sensitivities is crucial. Simply imposing Western standards might not be effective. International efforts should focus on supporting capacity building, knowledge sharing, and collaborative development of solutions that work within the Indian context.

5.1. Comparative analysis of animal rights laws in different countries

Animal protection laws differ around the world. Some countries, like Germany, protect more types of animals, even insects. Others mostly focus on cats, dogs, and birds. There are also different rules for pets compared to farm animals. Many places have guidelines for animal care, like food, housing, and vet visits, but the specifics vary. The same goes for rules on painful procedures like tail docking. Some countries ban them, while others allow them with limitations³³. Testing animals for science or makeup also has different rules. Some countries forbid it entirely, while others have a system to approve or deny it.

Ultimately, the effectiveness of animal rights laws hinges on robust enforcement mechanisms. Dedicated government agencies with adequate resources and training are crucial. Clear and accessible channels for reporting suspected animal cruelty are essential as well.

The European Union stands as an example of a comprehensive approach. They have established

³² Farm Animal Welfare Committee (FAWC), (Oct. 1, 2019), <https://www.gov.uk/government/groups/farm-animal-welfare-committee-fawc>

³³ Susan Cosier, Everything You Need to Know About Buying Ethically Sourced Down Products, (Dec.18, 2020), <https://www.audubon.org/news/everything-you-need-know-about-buying-ethically-sourced-down-products>

a framework of animal welfare legislation that sets minimum standards across all member states³⁴. The United Kingdom has also developed strong animal welfare laws, emphasizing the "Five Freedoms" of animal welfare. In contrast, the United States has a federal Animal Welfare Act, but enforcement is primarily handled at the state level, resulting in a less consistent set of regulations.

Challenges to effective animal rights laws are multifaceted. Resource constraints and a lack of trained personnel can hinder enforcement in some countries³⁵. The global landscape of animal rights laws is constantly evolving, shaped by international collaboration, knowledge sharing, and evolving ethical considerations.

5.2. India's participation in international animal rights conventions

India's involvement in international agreements highlights its commitment to wildlife conservation, which has a positive impact on animal welfare. A key aspect of this involvement is membership in conventions with a direct animal welfare focus, such as the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES). Established in 1976, CITES regulates international trade in endangered species to prevent their overexploitation. Additionally, India is a party to the Convention on the Conservation of Migratory Species of Wild Animals (CMS), which aims to conserve migratory animals across their range. India signed the CMS in 1979 and ratified it in 1983.

However, India's international memberships extend beyond those with an exclusive animal welfare focus. The Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD) ratified in 1992, promotes sustainable development and conservation of biodiversity, which encompasses animal species and their habitats³⁶. Similarly, the World Heritage Convention, ratified in 1977, aims to protect cultural and natural heritage sites that can be crucial habitat for wildlife. India's membership in the International Union for the Conservation of Nature (IUCN) further emphasizes its commitment to conservation and sustainable use of natural resources, including wildlife.

These conventions have specific implications for India. CITES necessitates regulating and monitoring trade in endangered animal species and related products. As a member of the CMS, India is responsible for conserving migratory animal species that travel through or breed within

³⁴ Farm Animal Welfare Committee (FAWC), (Oct. 1, 2019), <https://www.gov.uk/government/groups/farm-animal-welfare-committee-fawc>

³⁵ Laws that Protect Animals, <https://aldf.org/article/laws-that-protect-animals/>

³⁶ The Convention on Biological Diversity, <https://www.cbd.int/convention/articles/default.shtml>

its borders. The CBD requires India to develop national strategies for biodiversity conservation, which includes animal species³⁷. Finally, the World Heritage Convention obligates India to protect designated World Heritage Sites that hold significance for wildlife.

It's important to remember that the primary focus of these conventions is wildlife conservation, not necessarily the welfare of all animals. While there is some overlap, the distinction is crucial. Additionally, these conventions often rely on member states to implement national-level legislation and enforcement mechanisms, which can vary in effectiveness.

6. Proposed Reforms

India is working on improving animal welfare laws. We're looking at updating the penalties for cruelty to animals, which are currently too low. They might also expand the law to cover more situations, like factory farms and animal entertainment. To enforce the laws better, they might create a special animal protection agency or train vets to report animal cruelty.

Educating the public is also important, so they might teach kids about animal rights in school and have campaigns about responsible pet ownership. They also want to reduce the use of animals in testing by finding other ways to do research. If animal testing is still needed, they want stricter rules to make sure the animals don't suffer as much.

Other areas we're looking at include managing stray animals humanely and making sure slaughterhouses treat animals humanely. It's not easy to balance animal welfare with economics and traditions, and there's not a lot of money to make these changes. But by updating laws, enforcing them better, educating the public, and working together, India can create a better future for animals.

6.1. Strengthening existing animal welfare laws

India's animal welfare laws, primarily the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals (PCA) Act of 1960, are under scrutiny for being outdated and lacking teeth. A key focus for reform is modernizing the PCA Act³⁸. This includes significantly raising fines, which are currently seen as negligible, and introducing imprisonment for severe cruelty cases to act as a stronger deterrent. Additionally, the

³⁷ Convention Concerning the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage, <https://whc.unesco.org/en/conventiontext/>

³⁸ Law Corner, Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, 1960 – An Overview, (June 25, 2021), <https://lawcorner.in/prevention-of-cruelty-to-animals-act-1960-an-overview/>

Act's scope could be expanded to address contemporary concerns like factory farming practices, intensive animal agriculture, and the use of animals in entertainment.

Efforts are underway to strengthen enforcement mechanisms for animal welfare laws in India. This may involve the creation of dedicated animal protection units or training programs for veterinarians to identify and report suspected cruelty. Regular people can help too by reporting what they see and making sure someone investigates.

The laws themselves need some work too. There is a need to be clearer about what exactly counts as cruelty and maybe even protect more types of animals. Slaughterhouses need stricter rules and more inspections to make sure animals are treated well before they're killed.

It's not always easy to balance protecting animals with making money or following traditions. We need to talk things out and find ways to do things differently that are still good for everyone. It also costs money to make these changes, which can be tough. But if everyone works together, we can make the laws stronger, enforce them better, and teach people to care more about animals in India.

6.2. Introducing stricter penalties for animal cruelty

India is considering increasing penalties for animal cruelty outlined in the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals (PCA) Act, 1960. The current penalties are widely seen as insufficient. Proponents of stricter penalties argue they would act as a stronger deterrent, discouraging animal abuse and potentially leading to fewer cruelty incidents. Additionally, stiffer penalties could incentivize better enforcement by law enforcement as the potential consequences become more significant. Stronger penalties could also send a message to the public that animal cruelty is a serious offense.

However, challenges exist. Stricter penalties alone won't be effective without robust enforcement mechanisms. Increased funding would be needed for dedicated animal welfare enforcement units or training existing personnel. There are also concerns that stricter penalties might disproportionately impact marginalized communities who rely on working animals. Exceptions and educational initiatives could be implemented to address these concerns³⁹. Finally, while punishment is important, efforts should also focus on rehabilitating offenders and promoting

³⁹ Annette Manusevich, Factory Farming—Climate Change and Cruelty, (Aug. 31, 2022), www.worldanimalprotection.us/latest/blogs/climate-change-and-cruelty/

responsible animal ownership through education and awareness campaigns.

Examples from other countries, like the UK with its tiered approach to penalties or Australia with its high maximum imprisonment terms, offer some guidance. India can take a positive step by introducing stricter penalties, but it should be done within a comprehensive approach that strengthens enforcement, educates the public, and promotes responsible animal ownership. This collaborative effort between animal welfare organizations, the government, and the public can create a more effective system to deter animal cruelty and improve animal protection in India.

6.3. Promoting animal rights education and awareness

In India, educating people about animal rights is key to fostering respect for animals. Schools can start by teaching children about animal welfare, responsible pet ownership, and empathy from a young age. Interactive lessons and guest speakers from animal welfare groups can make learning engaging. At higher education levels, discussions can explore complex issues like factory farming. Public awareness campaigns through media, events, and partnerships with shelters can raise awareness and encourage responsible behaviour.

Community engagement is also important. Programs can teach responsible pet ownership and empower people to report animal cruelty. Different educational materials are needed for rural and urban audiences. Collaboration with religious leaders and veterinarians can promote compassion and responsible practices. Public-private partnerships and government support are crucial to overcome resource constraints. By educating people and promoting a gradual shift in attitudes, India can create a more compassionate future for animals.

7. Conclusion

India's relationship with animal rights is complex and evolving. Ancient beliefs promoting compassion for living beings coexist with modern challenges like factory farming. The country has made strides with the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act and growing legal frameworks, but enforcement and public awareness remain hurdles.

Education is a cornerstone for change. Schools can integrate animal welfare concepts while public awareness campaigns utilize media and community events to raise consciousness. Collaborative efforts involving animal rights organizations, religious leaders, and veterinarians are crucial.

Challenges include balancing animal welfare with economic considerations and cultural sensitivities. Open dialogue, exploring alternative practices, and resource allocation are necessary to navigate these complexities.

Ultimately, a multi-pronged approach that strengthens legal frameworks, improves enforcement, fosters public compassion through education, and encourages collaboration among stakeholders is key to securing a more humane future for animals in India.

